

11.3 Procurement - Supply of Four Side Load Garbage Trucks

(NPV) Net Present Value & Change Over Cost

Supplier		Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / MJ	Isuzu / MJ	Iveco / Superior 29cm3	Iveco / Superior 30cm3	Iveco / Superior 33cm3
Compactor Siz		28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	28cm3	28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	29cm3	35cm3	29cm3	30cm3	33cm3
Tendered price		333,229.00	340,857.00	344,991.00	376,322.33	376,322.33	383,950.33	386,084.33	397,166.36	395,148.18	317,119.45	324,747.45	326,881.45
Trade in		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Net Change over		333229	340857	344991	376322.3273	376322.3273	383950.3273	386084.3273	397166.3636	395148.1818	317119.4545	324747.4545	326881.4545
Annual Cost over the life of the item	7%												
Cost in today's dollars Year 1	1	\$118,144.00	\$120,508.00	\$121,789.00	\$131,499.00	\$131,499.00	\$133,863.00	\$134,525.00	\$137,959.00	\$137,334.00	\$113,151.00	\$115,515.00	\$116,176.00
Cost in today's dollars Year 2	0.9300	\$109,873.92	\$112,072.44	\$113,263.77	\$122,294.07	\$122,294.07	\$124,492.59	\$125,108.25	\$128,301.87	\$127,720.62	\$105,230.43	\$107,428.95	\$108,043.68
Cost in today's dollars Year 3	0.8600	\$101,603.84	\$103,636.88	\$104,738.54	\$113,089.14	\$113,089.14	\$115,122.18	\$115,691.50	\$118,644.74	\$118,107.24	\$97,309.86	\$99,342.90	\$99,911.36
Cost in today's dollars Year 4	0.7900	\$93,333.76	\$95,201.32	\$96,213.31	\$103,884.21	\$103,884.21	\$105,751.77	\$106,274.75	\$108,987.61	\$108,493.86	\$89,389.29	\$91,256.85	\$91,779.04
Cost in today's dollars Year 5	0.7200	\$85,063.68	\$86,765.76	\$87,688.08	\$94,679.28	\$94,679.28	\$96,381.36	\$96,858.00	\$99,330.48	\$98,880.48	\$81,468.72	\$83,170.80	\$83,646.72
Cost in today's dollars Year 6	0.6500	\$76,793.60	\$78,330.20	\$79,162.85	\$85,474.35	\$85,474.35	\$87,010.95	\$87,441.25	\$89,673.35	\$89,267.10	\$73,548.15	\$75,084.75	\$75,514.40
Total annual NPV of ownership in today's \$		\$584,812.80	\$596,514.60	\$602,855.55	\$650,920.05	\$650,920.05	\$662,621.85	\$665,898.75	\$682,897.05	\$679,803.30	\$560,097.45	\$571,799.25	\$575,071.20
Whole of Life Cost of the tendered items (Total Annual NPV plus Net Change Over cost)		\$918,041.80	\$937,371.60	\$947,846.55	\$1,027,242.38	\$1,027,242.38	\$1,046,572.18	\$1,051,983.08	\$1,080,063.41	\$1,074,951.48	\$877,216.90	\$896,546.70	\$901,952.65
Score out of 5		37.50	36.73	36.32	33.51	33.51	32.90	32.73	31.88	32.03	39.25	38.40	38.17
Position		9	12	13	17	17	20	21	23	22	3	4	6

(NPV) Net Present Value &

Supplier		Iveco / MJ 25cm3	Iveco / MJ 29cm3	Iveco / MJ 35cm3	Volvo / Superior Pac 28cm3	Volvo / Superior Pac 30cm3	Volvo / Superior Pac 33cm3	Volvo MJ 29cm3	Volvo MJ 35cm3	Acco Manco 27cm3	Acco Manco 31cm3	Hino Manco 27cm3	Hino Manco 31cm3
Compactor Siz		25cm3	29cm3	35cm3	28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	29cm3	35cm3	27cm3	31cm3	27cm3	31cm3
Tendered price		331,879.55	334,285.91	338,513.18	363,044.00	370,672.00	372,806.00	378,433.64	380,960.91	326,610.00	329,889.09	310,592.73	313,871.82
Trade in		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Net Change over		331879.5455	334285.9091	338513.1818	363044	370672	372806	378433.6364	380960.9091	326610	329889.0909	310592.7273	313871.8182
Annual Cost over the life of the item	7%												
Cost in today's dollars Year 1	1	\$117,725.00	\$118,471.00	\$119,781.00	\$119,016.00	\$129,748.00	\$130,410.00	\$132,154.00	\$132,937.00	\$116,092.00	\$117,109.00	\$111,128.00	\$112,144.00
Cost in today's dollars Year 2	0.9300	\$109,484.25	\$110,178.03	\$111,396.33	\$110,684.88	\$120,665.64	\$121,281.30	\$122,903.22	\$123,631.41	\$107,965.56	\$108,911.37	\$103,349.04	\$104,293.92
Cost in today's dollars Year 3	0.8600	\$101,243.50	\$101,885.06	\$103,011.66	\$102,353.76	\$111,583.28	\$112,152.60	\$113,652.44	\$114,325.82	\$99,839.12	\$100,713.74	\$95,570.08	\$96,443.84
Cost in today's dollars Year 4	0.7900	\$93,002.75	\$93,592.09	\$94,626.99	\$94,022.64	\$102,500.92	\$103,023.90	\$104,401.66	\$105,020.23	\$91,712.68	\$92,516.11	\$87,791.12	\$88,593.76
Cost in today's dollars Year 5	0.7200	\$84,762.00	\$85,299.12	\$86,242.32	\$85,691.52	\$93,418.56	\$93,895.20	\$95,150.88	\$95,714.64	\$83,586.24	\$84,318.48	\$80,012.16	\$80,743.68
Cost in today's dollars Year 6	0.6500	\$76,521.25	\$77,006.15	\$77,857.65	\$77,360.40	\$84,336.20	\$84,766.50	\$85,900.10	\$86,409.05	\$75,459.80	\$76,120.85	\$72,233.20	\$72,893.60
Total annual NPV of ownership in today's \$		\$582,738.75	\$586,431.45	\$592,915.95	\$589,129.20	\$642,252.60	\$645,529.50	\$654,162.30	\$658,038.15	\$574,655.40	\$579,689.55	\$550,083.60	\$555,112.80
Whole of Life Cost of the tendered items (Total Annual NPV plus Net Change Over cost)		\$914,618.30	\$920,717.36	\$931,429.13	\$952,173.20	\$1,012,924.60	\$1,018,335.50	\$1,032,595.94	\$1,038,999.06	\$901,265.40	\$909,578.64	\$860,676.33	\$868,984.62
Score out of 5		37.64	37.39	36.96	36.16	33.99	33.81	33.34	33.13	38.20	37.85	40.00	39.62
Position		8	10	11	14	15	16	18	19	5	7	1	2

Criteria Assessment

		Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Dennis Eagle Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac	Isuzu / Superior Pac					Iveco / Superior 29cm3	Iveco / Superior 30cm3
		28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	28cm3	28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	Isuzu / MJ	Isuzu / MJ	Isuzu / MJ	Isuzu / MJ	29cm3	30cm3
		elite 2 5180wb	elite 2 5180wb	elite 2 5680wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5550wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5300wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5300wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5500wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5150wb	Isuzu FVY1402 5300wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5300wb	Isuzu FVY1400 5500wb	Acco 5200wb	Acco 5200wb
Total Price (40%)	40%	37.43	36.64	36.23	33.36	33.36	32.73	32.56	0.00	0.00	31.69	31.84	39.22	38.35
Capability (30%)														
Relevant Experience / Past Performance	5%	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	5	5
Demonstrated Weight Capability	7.5%	6.97	6.98	6.84	7.47	7.47	7.50	7.39	7.22	6.18	6.53	6.34	7.12	7.27
Turning Circle	7.5%	7.40	7.28	6.88	7.32	7.30	7.30	7.06	7.30	7.30	7.30	7.06	7.27	6.94
Availability of spares	5%	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
Experience & Qualifications of Services Personal	5%	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
Functionality / Conformity (30%)														
Meets business requirements (Staff Assessment)	15%	13.21	13.21	13.21	13.93	13.93	13.93	13.93	12.58	12.58	12.58	12.58	13.74	13.74
Conformity with specification	15%	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	4	4	12	12	12	12
Total	100%	88.01	87.11	86.15	87.08	87.06	86.46	85.93	44.10	43.07	83.10	82.81	94.35	93.30
		13	15	19	16	17	18	21	25	26	22	23	1	2

Criteria Assessment

		Iveco / Superior 33cm3	Iveco / MJ 25cm3	Iveco / MJ 29cm3	Iveco / MJ 35cm3	Volvo / Superior Pac	Volvo / Superior Pac	Volvo / Superior Pac			Acco Manco	Acco Manco	Hino Manco	Hino Manco
		33cm3	25cm3	29cm3	35cm3	28cm3	30cm3	33cm3	Volvo MJ 29cm3	Volvo MJ 35cm3	27cm3	31cm3	27cm3	31cm3
		Acco 5500wb	Acco 5000wb	Acco 5200wb	Acco 5500wb	Volvo FE 5180wb	Volvo FE 5180wb	Volvo FE 5680wb	Volvo FE 5335wb	Volvo FE	Acco (5200wb)	Acco (5900wb)	Hino2628 5600wb	Hino2628 5900wb
Total Price (40%)	40%	38.12	37.58	37.32	36.88	34.52	33.84	33.66	33.18	32.97	38.15	37.79	40.00	39.61
Capability (30%)														
Relevant Experience / Past Performance	5%	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	3
Demonstrated Weight Capability	7.5%	7.04	7.15	6.79	6.45	7.30	7.33	7.20	6.03	0.00	6.85	6.69	6.85	6.95
Turning Circle	7.5%	6.94	7.50	7.27	6.94	7.28	7.28	7.28	7.25	7.25	7.27	6.93	6.23	6.00
Availability of spares	5%	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4
Experience & Qualifications of Services Personal	5%	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4
Functionality / Conformity (30%)														
Meets business requirements (Staff Assessment)	15%	13.74	12.39	12.39	12.39	15.00	15.00	15.00	13.65	13.65	12.95	12.95	12.68	12.68
Conformity with specification	15%	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
Total	100%	92.85	91.63	90.77	89.67	90.10	89.45	89.14	86.11	79.86	88.21	87.37	88.76	88.23
		3	4	5	7	6	9	8	20	24	12	14	10	11