

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

Attendance

Cr David Wright (Mayor - in the chair), Jeff Johnson, Keith Williams, Keith Johnson, Ken Johnston, Paul Worth, Ben Smith and Robyn Hordern.

Paul Hickey (General Manager), John Truman (Civil Services Group Manager), Graham Plumb (Acting Regulatory Services Group Manager), Steve Barnier (Strategic & Community Services Group Manager), Peter Morgan (Finance Manager) and Sandra Bailey (Secretary) were in attendance.

There were 10 people in the gallery at this time.

1. Apologies

An apology was received from Cr Sharon Cadwallader.

Absent

Cr Susan Meehan

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Robyn Hordern)

That such apology be accepted.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

2. Declarations of Interest

Nil

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

3. Deputations

- **Kerri Fairlie, Richmond-Tweed Regional Library** – spoke in relation to Item 4.1 – Richmond Room.
- **Lorraine Fox – RSL Lighthouse Day Club** – spoke in relation to Item 4.1 – Richmond Room.
- **Leanne Latham – Australian Red Cross** – spoke in relation to Item 4.1 – Richmond Room.
- **Robyn Lawrence** – spoke in relation to Item 4.7- Community Infrastructure – Non-recurrent Project Priorities and in particular the Sports & Events Centre.
- **Judy Smith** – spoke in relation to Item 4.7 – Community Infrastructure – Non-recurrent Project Priorities and in particular the Sports & Events Centre.

4. Committee Reports

4.1 Richmond Room

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Keith Johnson/Cr Paul Worth)

That Council commit to the enlargement of the Library into the Richmond Room by 31 December 2013 and continue to pursue other options for Richmond Room users affected.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Williams, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Paul Worth, Cr Robyn Hordern and Cr Ben Smith

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson and Cr Ken Johnston

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

4.7 Community Infrastructure - Non-recurrent Project Priorities

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Keith Johnson)

1. That Council notes the various actions listed in this report for non recurrent capital projects.
2. That Council endorses the following actions for the various projects listed:

Lennox Head Surf Club and Lake Ainsworth Road Closure / Drainage

That Council reduce the \$400,000 allocation in the 2012/13 budget to \$50,000 with the balance transferred to 2013/14. This better reflects the timing of the expenditure on this consultancy and related costs such as Council development application fees.

Ballina Swimming Pool

As per the 4 March Finance Committee recommendation the 2013/14 budget is to include \$200,000 for plans and development consent. This \$200,000 will be funded from Council's Community Infrastructure Reserve however the availability of those funds may depend on land sales.

Alstonville Swimming Pool

As per the 4 March Finance Committee recommendation the 2013/14 budget is to include \$50,000 to improve the tanks and drainage with this funding sourced from the Community Infrastructure Reserve, however the availability of those funds may depend on land sales.

Shared Pathway

Any funds unexpended from 2012/13 are to be rolled forward into the 2013/14 budget and combined with the recurrent funding in that budget for this project.

Lennox Head Cultural and Community Centre (LHCCC)

- a) Council notes the PA and AV system forms part of the forward financial plan for the Community Infrastructure Improvements recurrent funding and that other major purchases for the LHCCC may also need to be funded from this recurrent funding source.
- b) The Centre manager is to pursue more minor purchases from extra income generation, expenditure savings or existing budgets.
- c) Council notes the sound proofing improvement estimates will be subject to the outcomes from the current audio consultancy.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

- d) Council approves a recurrent allocation for capital improvements to the LHCCC with \$10,000 to be allocated in the 2013/14 budget and increases to be added in future years.

Street Tree Planting Program

That Council progressively increase the funding for street trees by above the CPI with a target recurrent budget of \$30,000 per annum.

Naval Museum

- a) That in respect to the Naval Museum Council awaits the outcomes from the architectural consultancy and the current grant application with the NSW State Government prior to making any decision on funding or work priorities.
- b) That Council acknowledges that funding may be available for improvements to this facility from the recurrent budget for Community Infrastructure Improvements, which currently has funding allocated in 2015/16 for the Naval Museum. If any works are considered to be a higher priority then the forward plan for the Community Infrastructure Improvements funding will need to be reviewed.

Public Toilets

That Council introduce a recurrent budget in 2013/14 of \$25,000 for public toilet improvements with that budget to be increased by \$25,000 per annum until it reaches \$100,000 plus any CPI.

Library Expansion

That Council notes the contents of the earlier report in this agenda in respect to the Ballina Library expansion.

War Memorials

That Council await further feedback from the on-going discussions with the RSL Sub-branches in respect to the preferred War Memorial Projects.

Shaws Bay and Lake Ainsworth Management Plans and Associated Projects

That Council combine the \$15,000 for the Shaws Bay and Lake Ainsworth Management Plans in the 2012/13 budget with the \$30,000 allocated in the draft 2013/14 budget to allow a review of the Shaws Bay Management Plan to be completed during 2013/14.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

Sports and Events Centre

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Jeff Johnson/Cr Ken Johnston)

- a) Mayor is to meet with Mr Don Page to pursue the availability of the Old Depot site for use for the centre. That a member of BRISA be invited to attend this meeting.
- b) Council confirms it is not proceeding with the Kingsford Smith precinct master plan.
- c) Council to write to the Ballina Seagulls Rugby League Club confirming the integrated two court facility is no longer our preferred option.
- d) PDT is to provide a site analysis report on the Old Depot Site and the Ferngrove open space area to confirm a preferred location for the proposed four court stadium. This report is to be submitted to a Facilities Committee meeting. That Council not expend any funds until the outcome of the ownership issues with the old Depot site are clarified.
- e) Any unexpended funds from the \$409,000 allocated in the 2012/13 budget for this project are to be rolled forward into the 2013/14 budget for the continuation of this project.
- f) Council will continue to lobby State and Federal Government representatives for grant funding opportunities.

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Keith Williams

- a) Mayor is to meet with Mr Don Page to pursue the remediation of the Old Depot site and that this site is not the preferred option for the four court basketball stadium.
- b) Council confirms it is not proceeding with the Kingsford Smith precinct master plan.
- c) Council to write to the Ballina Seagulls Rugby League Club confirming the integrated two court facility is no longer our preferred option.
- d) PDT is to provide a site analysis report on the Old Depot Site and the Ferngrove open space area to confirm a preferred location for the proposed four court stadium. This report is to be submitted to a Facilities Committee meeting. That Council not expend any funds until the outcome of the ownership issues with the old Depot site are clarified.
- e) Any unexpended funds from the \$409,000 allocated in the 2012/13 budget for this project are to be rolled forward into the 2013/14 budget for the continuation of this project.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

- f) Council will continue to lobby State and Federal Government representatives for grant funding opportunities.

The **Amendment LAPSED**.

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Ben Smith and seconded by Cr Robyn Hordern

- a) Mayor is to meet with Mr Don Page to pursue the availability of the Old Depot site for use for the centre with invitees to be at the Mayor's discretion.
- b) PDT is to provide a site analysis report on the Old Depot Site and the Ferngrove open space area to confirm a preferred location for the proposed four court stadium. This report is to be submitted to a Facilities Committee meeting. That Council not expend any funds until the outcome of the ownership issues with the old Depot site are clarified.
- c) Any unexpended funds from the \$409,000 allocated in the 2012/13 budget for this project are to be rolled forward into the 2013/14 budget for the continuation of this project.
- d) Council will continue to lobby State and Federal Government representatives for grant funding opportunities.

The **Amendment** was **CARRIED**.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Paul Worth, Cr Robyn Hordern and Cr Ben Smith

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Keith Williams and Cr Ken Johnston
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

The **Amendment** then became the **Motion** and was **CARRIED**.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Paul Worth, Cr Robyn Hordern and Cr Ben Smith

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Keith Williams and Cr Ken Johnston
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Robyn Hordern)

- a) Mayor is to meet with Mr Don Page to pursue the availability of the Old Depot site for use for the centre with invitees to be at the Mayor's discretion.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

- b) PDT is to provide a site analysis report on the Old Depot Site and the Ferngrove open space area to confirm a preferred location for the proposed four court stadium. This report is to be submitted to a Facilities Committee meeting. That Council not expend any funds until the outcome of the ownership issues with the old Depot site are clarified.
- c) Any unexpended funds from the \$409,000 allocated in the 2012/13 budget for this project are to be rolled forward into the 2013/14 budget for the continuation of this project.
- d) Council will continue to lobby State and Federal Government representatives for grant funding opportunities.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Paul Worth, Cr Robyn Hordern and Cr Ben Smith

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Keith Williams and Cr Ken Johnston

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

Bicentennial Park Upgrade

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Robyn Hordern

That Council finance Missingham Park (\$150,000 – 2013/14) and Bicentennial Park (\$100,000 – 2014/15) from Quarry Reserves .

The **Motion LAPSED**.

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Paul Worth/Cr Ben Smith)

That Council notes the report in respect to Bicentennial Park and Missingham Park and that the projects are not funded in the forward financial plan.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Paul Worth and Cr Ben Smith and the casting vote of the Mayor

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Keith Williams, Cr Ken Johnston and Cr Robyn Hordern

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

Ballina Town Entry Treatments/ Missingham Park – Car Park and Infrastructure

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Ben Smith

That Council monitor the implementation of the Ballina Town Entry treatments with the program to be reassessed following the expenditure of the \$150,000 allocated.

The **Motion LAPSED**.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Keith Johnson/Cr Robyn Hordern)

That the \$150,000 programmed for the Ballina Town Entry Treatments be allocated to the carpark at Missingham Park.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Williams, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Ken Johnston, Cr Paul Worth and Cr Robyn Hordern

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson and Cr Ben Smith

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

4.2 North East Weight of Loads Group (NEWLOG)

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Keith Williams)

That Council notes the contents of the NEWLOG Annual Report for 2011/12, the current state of the 2012/13 budget and the draft budget for 2013/14.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Susan Meehan

Cr Ben Smith left the meeting at 05:42 pm.

4.3 Financial Performance Indicators - Review

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Keith Williams/Cr Paul Worth)

1. That Council amended the existing the benchmark for the Unrestricted Current Ratio from 2:1 to 1.5:1 in Council's Financial Planning Policy as 1.5:1 is considered to be satisfactory by independent external bodies such as Council's external auditor and NSW Treasury Corporation.
2. That Council write to the NSW Division of Local Government asking that they review the rates and charges coverage ratio for water operations as there is an inconsistency in that ratio and the State Government's directives for water demand strategies, which place a heavy focus on the use of consumption charges as the major source of income.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Keith Williams, Cr Keith Johnson, Cr Ken Johnston, Cr Paul Worth and Cr Robyn Hordern

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Jeff Johnson

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

4.4 Fees and Charges - 2013/14

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Keith Williams/Cr Robyn Hordern)

That Council approves the exhibition of the draft schedule of fees and charges for 2013/14, as attached, including any adjustments resulting from this meeting.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

4.5 Waste Operations - Long Term Financial Plan

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Paul Worth and seconded by Cr Robyn Hordern

That Council, based on the current financial information available, endorses the inclusion of the following waste charging structure in the draft 2013/14 Operational Plan.

Waste Charges- LRM

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
Commercial Mixed Waste (Annual)	292	303	4*
Commercial Recycling (Annual)	144	150	4*
Green Waste (Annual)	255	265	4*
DWM Gate Fee Mixed Waste	245/tonne	245/tonne	nil
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed > 300kg	190/tonne	217/tonne	14
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed < 300kg	190/tonne	200/tonne	5
DWM Gate Fee Recyclates	185/tonne	194/tonne	5
Self Haul Gate Fee Recyclates	75/tonne	79/tonne	5
Self Haul Gate Fees Other	Various	Up to 5%	Up to 5%

Domestic Waste Charges

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
DWM - Rural (excludes green)	350	364	4
DWM – Rural (no collection)	287	398	4
DWM – Urban (all 3 collections)	392	408	4
Additional Mixed Waste urban	146	152	4
Additional Mixed Waste rural	292	303	4
Additional Domestic Recycling	141	147	4
Additional Green Waste Collection	255	265	4
DWM – Vacant Land	35	37	4

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Jeff Johnson and seconded by Cr Keith Williams

1. That Council receive a further report, based on reducing the DWM Gate fee Recyclates to \$100/tonne and the Self Haul Gate Fee Recyclates to \$0/tonne.
2. That Council, based on the current financial information available, endorses the inclusion of the following waste charging structure in the draft 2013/14 Operational Plan.

Waste Charges- LRM

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
Commercial Mixed Waste (Annual)	292	303	4*
Commercial Recycling (Annual)	144	150	4*
Green Waste (Annual)	255	265	4*
DWM Gate Fee Mixed Waste	245/tonne	245/tonne	nil
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed > 300kg	190/tonne	217/tonne	14
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed < 300kg	190/tonne	200/tonne	5
Self Haul Gate Fees Other	Various	Up to 5%	Up to 5%

Domestic Waste Charges

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
DWM - Rural (excludes green)	350	364	4
DWM – Rural (no collection)	287	398	4
DWM – Urban (all 3 collections)	392	408	4
Additional Mixed Waste urban	146	152	4
Additional Mixed Waste rural	292	303	4
Additional Domestic Recycling	141	147	4
Additional Green Waste Collection	255	265	4
DWM – Vacant Land	35	37	4

The **Amendment** was **CARRIED**.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

THE Amendment then became the Motion and was **CARRIED**..

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Jeff Johnson/Cr Keith Williams)

1. That Council receive a further report, based on reducing the DWM Gate fee Recyclates to \$100/tonne and the Self Haul Gate Fee Recyclates to \$0/tonne.
2. That Council, based on the current financial information available, endorses the inclusion of the following waste charging structure in the draft 2013/14 Operational Plan.

Waste Charges- LRM

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
Commercial Mixed Waste (Annual)	292	303	4*
Commercial Recycling (Annual)	144	150	4*
Green Waste (Annual)	255	265	4*
DWM Gate Fee Mixed Waste	245/tonne	245/tonne	nil
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed > 300kg	190/tonne	217/tonne	14
Self Haul Gate Fee Mixed < 300kg	190/tonne	200/tonne	5
Self Haul Gate Fees Other	Various	Up to 5%	Up to 5%

Domestic Waste Charges

Charge Type	2012/13 Charge \$	2013/14 Charge \$	% Increase
DWM - Rural (excludes green)	350	364	4
DWM – Rural (no collection)	287	398	4
DWM – Urban (all 3 collections)	392	408	4
Additional Mixed Waste urban	146	152	4
Additional Mixed Waste rural	292	303	4
Additional Domestic Recycling	141	147	4
Additional Green Waste Collection	255	265	4
DWM – Vacant Land	35	37	4

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREET, BALLINA,
ON 25/03/13 AT 4.00 PM**

4.6 Capital Works - Recurrent - 2013/14 to 2016/17

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Keith Johnson/Cr Keith Williams)

That Council approves the Capital Works – Recurrent works plans, as outlined in this report, for inclusion in the draft 2013/14 Operational Plan and Delivery Program.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Cadwallader, Cr Susan Meehan and Cr Ben Smith

MEETING CLOSURE

6.07 pm