

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

Attendance

Crs David Wright (Mayor - in the chair), Phillip Meehan, Sharon Parry, Jeff Johnson, Eoin Johnston, Stephen McCarthy, Nathan Willis, Keith Williams, Sharon Cadwallader and Ben Smith.

Paul Hickey (General Manager), John Truman (Group Manager Civil Services), Rod Willis (Group Manager Development and Environmental Health), Steve Barnier (Group Manager Strategic and Community Facilities), Linda Coulter (Manager Financial Services) and Sarah Carden (Secretary) were in attendance.

There were two people in the gallery at this time.

1. Apologies

Nil.

2. Declarations of Interest

Cr Phillip Meehan – declared an interest in Item 4.2 – Large domestic water user, non-pecuniary, non-specific, member of the Ballina Jockey Club

3. Deputations

- **Monica Wilcox, Lennox Head Residents Association** – spoke in favour of Item 4.5 – Lennox Head Town Centre – Main Street Upgrade

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4. Committee Reports

4.5 Lennox Head Town Centre - Main Street Upgrade

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Sharon Cadwallader and seconded by Cr Ben Smith)

1. That Council notes the contents of this report in respect of the design options for the proposed Lennox Head CBD Upgrade Project.
2. That Council defer undertaking further design work or community consultation regarding this project until the project is included in a future Operation Plan and Delivery Program.
3. That Council receive a report on options to loan fund the works as part of this council term.
4. That Council receive a report on possible relocation of the playground at Ross Park.

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Phillip Meehan

That Council fund the Lennox Head Town Centre – Main Street Upgrade from the waste dividends proposed for the Ballina Indoor Sports Centre.

The **Amendment LAPSED.**

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Ben Smith)

1. That Council notes the contents of this report in respect of the design options for the proposed Lennox Head CBD Upgrade Project.
2. That Council defer undertaking further design work or community consultation regarding this project until the project is included in a future Operation Plan and Delivery Program.
3. That Council receive a report on options to loan fund the works as part of this council term.
4. That Council receive a report on possible relocation of the playground at Ross Park.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Sharon Parry and Cr Jeff Johnson

Cr Eoin Johnston arrived at the meeting at 04:09 pm.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

Cr Sharon Parry arrived at the meeting at 04:14 pm.

Cr Jeff Johnson arrived at the meeting at 04:17 pm.

4.1 Ballina - Byron Gateway Airport - Long Term Financial Plan

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

1. That Council endorses the revised long term financial plan for the Ballina – Byron Gateway Airport, as attached to this report, for inclusion in the draft 2017/18 Delivery Program and Operational Plan.
2. That Council confirms an increase in the terminal expansion budget to \$6.9m based on a loan of \$2.5m and State Government grant funding of \$4.5m.
3. That Council receive a report on options for the implementation of solar power / panels as part of the future development plans for the airport.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

4.2 Large Non-Domestic Recycled Water Users – Pricing

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Nathan Willis)

1. The Council endorses option two, as outlined in this report, as the preferred pricing structure for Recycled Water Supply to Large Non-Domestic Users.
2. That Council approves a staged implementation of this fee over four years, commencing in 2017/18 based on the following increments:

2017/18	25%
2018/19	50%
2019/20	75%
2020/21	100%

3. That the pricing structure and implementation strategy be included in the draft 2017/18 Fees and Charges document for public comment.
4. That Council write to large non-domestic recycled water customers to inform them of the public exhibition of the draft 2017/18 Fees and Charges.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4.3 Land Valuations and Rating Structure - 2017/18

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Ben Smith/Cr Sharon Cadwallader)

1. That for the draft 2017/18 Operational Plan, Council approves the inclusion of a base rating structure, modelled on the 2016/17 structure, which applies the following principles:
 - a) Marginally less than 50% of the rate income for the residential category of properties being generated from the base amount
 - b) Business, farmland and mining categories to have the same base amount as the residential base amount
 - c) A total of 20% income from the rate yield to be sourced from the business category properties
 - d) Farmland rate in the dollar is approximately 85% of the residential rate in the dollar
 - e) The mining category rate in the dollar to be set as the same rate as the business category (currently no mining category properties in the shire).
2. That Council notes the indicative figures for this rating structure for 2017/18, are as follows as per the contents of this report:

Table Nine: Proposed 2017/18 Income per Category (Cat.) at 4.9%

Rate Category	2016/17			2017/18		
	Income 5.34% increase	Cat % of yield	Ave Rate	Income 4.9% increase	Cat % of yield	Ave Rate
Residential	14,748,183	72.55	943	15,629,051	72.66	985
Business	4,065,676	20.00	3,160	4,301,992	20.00	3,298
Farmland	1,514,776	7.45	1,448	1,579,118	7.34	1,514
Mining	0	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Total	20,328,634	100.0	1,131	21,510,160	100.00	1,181

Table 12: Proposed 2017/18 Rating Structure

Rating Category	2017/18 - 4.9% Increase	
	Base Amount	Rate in Dollar
Residential	491	0.1658284
Business	491	0.7558078
Farmland	491	0.1412750
Mining	491	0.7558078

3. That Council notes that the draft 2017/18 Operational Plan will also include a rating structure based on a 1.5% rate peg limit on the assumption that Council's proposed special rate variation may not be

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

approved.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

4.4 Plant Replacement Program

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Ben Smith)

1. That Council endorses, for strategic planning purposes, the Plant Replacement Program, as attached to this report, along with the Financial Plan.
2. That the draft 2017/18 Delivery and Operational Plan include a fleet procurement program in accordance with the Plant Replacement Program endorsed in point one above.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

4.6 Houghlahans Creek Road - Upgrade Consideration

A **Motion** was moved by Cr Phillip Meehan and seconded by Cr Sharon Cadwallader)

1. That based on the contents of this report Council confirms it will not include the sealing of Houghlahans Creek Road in the draft 2017/18 – 2020/21 Delivery and Operational Plan.
2. The reasons for the decision in point one include:
 - The stewardship of Council's road assets means its programs are prioritised to the maintenance and renewal of existing road assets.
 - The costs are significant and would represent a major proportion of the available funding for roads across the whole Shire.
 - The Council has not adopted a prioritised works program for the sealing of rural roads and before Council could consider allocating funds to an individual road it is appropriate that Council consider the priority and costs for all possible candidate roads for such a program.
 - The Council has significant unfunded road priorities identified on the basis of risk and reported in its Road Asset Management Plan
 - The relative low traffic volumes mean it is not reasonable to upgrade this road relative to other priorities for Council's limited resources.
 - The unsealed road is maintained by Council under its annual program and this provides a reasonable level of service.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Jeff Johnson and Cr Eoin Johnston

That Council commit to undertake the sealing of segment 80 (including associated road and drainage works) at an estimated cost of \$140,000.

FOR VOTE - Cr Sharon Parry, Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Eoin Johnston, Cr Nathan Willis and Cr Keith Williams

AGAINST VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Phillip Meehan, Cr Stephen McCarthy, Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Ben Smith, and the casting vote of the Mayor.

The **Amendment** was **LOST**.

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Phillip Meehan/Cr Sharon Cadwallader)

1. That based on the contents of this report Council confirms it will not include the sealing of Houghlahans Creek Road in the draft 2017/18 – 2020/21 Delivery and Operational Plan.
2. The reasons for the decision in point one include:
 - The stewardship of Council's road assets means its programs are prioritised to the maintenance and renewal of existing road assets.
 - The costs are significant and would represent a major proportion of the available funding for roads across the whole Shire.
 - The Council has not adopted a prioritised works program for the sealing of rural roads and before Council could consider allocating funds to an individual road it is appropriate that Council consider the priority and costs for all possible candidate roads for such a program.
 - The Council has significant unfunded road priorities identified on the basis of risk and reported in its Road Asset Management Plan
 - The relative low traffic volumes mean it is not reasonable to upgrade this road relative to other priorities for Council's limited resources.
 - The unsealed road is maintained by Council under its annual program and this provides a reasonable level of service.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Phillip Meehan, Cr Stephen McCarthy, Cr Sharon Cadwallader and Cr Ben Smith, and the casting vote of the Mayor.

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Sharon Parry, Cr Jeff Johnson, Cr Eoin Johnston, Cr Nathan Willis and Cr Keith Williams

Cr Ben Smith left the meeting at 05:36 pm.

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4.7 Community Infrastructure - Recurrent Projects and Funding

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That Council include in the draft 2017/18 Delivery Program and Operational Plan the recurrent capital work priorities as outlined in this report.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Ben Smith

4.8 Long Term Financial Plan - General Fund

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That Council notes the contents of this interim update on the Long Term Financial Plan for the General Fund.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Ben Smith

4.9 Public Reserve Management Fund - Applications

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Keith Williams)

That Council approves the following list of projects to be submitted as applications for the 2017/18 Public Reserve Management Fund, as detailed within this report.

Council Projects

Saunders Oval – Sports Field Lighting
Coastal Walk
Weed control – Williams Reserve

Community Projects

Fripp Oval Fencing
Ballina Tennis Club Extension

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4.10 Kerbside Bulky Waste Collection - Assessment

A **Motion** was moved Cr Sharon Cadwallader and seconded by Cr Keith Williams

1. That based on the contents of this report Council resolves not to proceed with the introduction of either a bulky waste collection service or free landfill drop off system.
2. That Council records the reasons for its decision in point one above including:
 - The financial impact to Council is significant and would result in increased waste charges.
 - The proposal is inconsistent with Council's objectives for waste recovery and landfill diversion.
 - The proposal is inconsistent with the emerging regulatory regime for waste management.
 - Residents are able to access the landfill on a user pays system and local contractors and other service providers are able to assist residents with collection and haulage of bulky goods.
 - For the kerbside collection, there are significant risks associated with environmental pollution, scavenging, residential amenity and illegal dumping.
 - The programs require significant additional resources to establish and implement.

An **Amendment** was moved by Cr Phillip Meehan and seconded by Cr Jeff Johnson

1. That Council receive a report on option two, being the provision of one free tip voucher per residential property per year.

FOR VOTE - Cr Phillip Meehan and Cr Jeff Johnson

AGAINST VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Sharon Parry, Cr Eoin Johnston, Cr Stephen McCarthy, Cr Nathan Willis, Cr Keith Williams and Cr Sharon Cadwallader

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Ben Smith

The **Amendment** was **LOST**

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Keith Williams)

1. That based on the contents of this report Council resolves not to proceed with the introduction of either a bulky waste collection service or free landfill drop off system.
2. That Council records the reasons for its decision in point one above including:
 - The financial impact to Council is significant and would result in increased waste charges.
 - The proposal is inconsistent with Council's objectives for waste recovery and landfill diversion.
 - The proposal is inconsistent with the emerging regulatory regime for waste management.
 - Residents are able to access the landfill on a user pays system and local contractors and other service providers are able to assist residents with collection and haulage of bulky goods.
 - For the kerbside collection, there are significant risks associated with environmental pollution, scavenging, residential amenity and illegal dumping.
 - The programs require significant additional resources to establish and implement.

FOR VOTE - Cr David Wright, Cr Sharon Parry, Cr Eoin Johnston, Cr Stephen McCarthy, Cr Nathan Willis, Cr Keith Williams and Cr Sharon Cadwallader

AGAINST VOTE - Cr Phillip Meehan and Cr Jeff Johnson

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Ben Smith

Cr Stephen McCarthy left the meeting at 06:28 pm.

4.11 Waste Operations - Long Term Financial Plan

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That Council endorses the inclusion of the LRM and DWM long term financial plans, as attached to this report, and the following waste charging structure, in the draft 2017/18 Delivery Program and Operational Plan for public exhibition:

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

LRM Waste Charges

Charge Type	2016/17 (\$)	2016/17 (\$)	% Change
Kerbside Non Domestic Mixed Waste (Annual)	342	348	1.8
Kerbside Non Domestic Recycling (Annual)	169	172	1.8
Kerbside Non Domestic Green Waste (Annual)	299	304	1.7
DWM Gate Fee Mixed Waste	261/tonne	266/tonne	1.9
Self-Haul Mixed Waste Under 300kg Over 300kg	225/tonne 261/tonne	230/tonne 266/tonne	2.2 1.9
DWM Gate Fee Recyclables	219/tonne	233/tonne	1.8
Self-Haul Recyclables	90/tonne	92/tonne	2.2
Self-Haul Brick & Concrete	90/tonne	170/tonne	88.9
Self-Haul Roof Tile Ceramics	90/tonne	170/tonne	88.9
Self-Haul Green Waste	71/tonne	72/tonne	1.4
Remaining Gate Fees	Various up to 5%	Various up to 5%	Up to 5%
Waste Operations Annual charge	73	0	Removed

Domestic Waste Charges

Charge Type	2016/17 (\$)	2016/17 (\$)	% Change
DWM - Rural (excludes green)	320	326	1.9
DWM – Urban (all three collections)	367	374	1.9
Additional Extra Mixed Waste Urban – Fortnight	110	112	1.8
Additional Mixed Waste Rural – Weekly	219	223	1.8
Additional Domestic Recycling	110	112	1.8
Additional Green Waste Collection - Urban Only	219	223	1.8
DWM – Vacant Land	40	40	-

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.
ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4.12 Wastewater Operations - Long Term Financial Plan

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That in respect to the Wastewater Operations Council endorses the annual charges, as per the following table, for exhibition in the draft 2017/18 Operational Plan, as well as the long term financial plan included, as per the attachments to this report.

Charge Type	2016/17 \$	2017/18 \$	% Increase
Residential availability charge	925	953	3.0
Residential availability charge vacant land	697	718	3.0
Non Residential Usage charge	2.34	2.41	3.0
Non Residential Access charge	Variable based on meter size		3.0
Recycled Water	80% of potable water step 1		

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

4.13 Community Strategic Plan 2017 - 2027 - Draft

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That Council approves the public exhibition of the draft Community Strategic Plan, as attached to this report.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

4.14 Debtor Write-off

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Jeff Johnson/Cr Eoin Johnston)

That Council notes the contents of this report in respect to the details of the outstanding debt.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

5. Confidential Session

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Sharon Parry)

That Council moves into committee of the whole with the meeting closed to the public, to consider the following item in accordance with Section 10A (2) of the Local Government Act 1993.

5.1 Debtor Write-off - Debtor Details

Reason for Confidentiality

This report is **CONFIDENTIAL** in accordance with Section 10A(2)(b) of the Local Government Act 1993. which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following:-

- b) the personal hardship of any resident or ratepayer

and in accordance with 10D(2)(c), on balance, the discussion of the matter in an open meeting is not considered to be in the public interest due to the nature of the personal matter.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

(The Council moved into Confidential Session at 6.36).

**MINUTES OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL
HELD IN THE BALLINA SHIRE COUNCIL CHAMBERS
40 CHERRY STREETS, BALLINA,
ON 16/03/17 AT 4.00 PM**

Open Council

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Jeff Johnson/Cr Eoin Johnston)

That Council move into Open Council and out of Committee of the Whole.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

(The Council moved into Open Council at 6.39).

The General Manager reported to the Open Meeting the recommendations made while in Confidential Session:

5.1 Debtor Write-off - Debtor Details

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Jeff Johnson/Cr Nathan Willis)

That Council approves the request for write-off of the debt of \$7,732.74, as outlined in this report, on the basis that recovery of the debt is considered unlikely and pursuit of the debt would incur further costs to Council.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

Adoption of Recommendations from Confidential Session

RECOMMENDATION

(Cr Sharon Cadwallader/Cr Nathan Willis)

That the recommendations made whilst in Confidential Session, be adopted.

FOR VOTE - All Councillors voted unanimously.

ABSENT. DID NOT VOTE - Cr Stephen McCarthy and Cr Ben Smith

MEETING CLOSURE

6.41 pm