

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

Time Commenced

The meeting commenced at 4.00pm.

1. Attendance and Apologies

Attendance

Cr David Wright	Mayor
Cr Phil Meehan	Councillor
Cr Stephen McCarthy	Councillor
Susan Meehan	Ballina Chamber of Commerce & Ballina Retail Action Group
Yvonne Scarrabelotti	Ballina CWA
Ross Pickering	Ballina & District Citizens & Ratepayers Association
Andrew Playford	Ballina Coast High School & East Ballina Lions Club.
George Young	Ballina Lions Club
Geoff Jacobs	Ballina Bears Cricket Club
David Felsch	Ballina Peninsular Residents Association
Marilyn McIntosh	Ballina Evening View Club
John Bout	Summerhill Residents Group

Council Staff in Attendance

John Truman	Group Manager Civil Services
Samala Heart	Waste Education Officer
Joanne Cordery	Secretary - Civil Services Group

Apologies

Lyn Davidson	Ballina CWA
--------------	-------------

2. Resignations/Changes to Memberships

Geoff Jacobs representing the Ballina Bears Cricket Club was welcomed as a new member.

3. Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

4. Deputations

Nil

5. Confirmation of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The Minutes of the previous meeting held on 9 July, 2019 were accepted as a true and correct record.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

6. Business Arising from Previous Minutes

Captain Cook Park - Light

The information in the staff report was noted. Yvonne Scarrabelotti thanked Council for repairing the light.

Sunken Culvert – Carrs Bridge

The information in the staff report was noted.

Water Leak - Bunnings

The information in the staff report is noted.

7. Presentation

Presentation – Waste Education

Council's Waste Education Officer, Samala Heart provided an update on Council programs to educate residents on waste management and support them towards better resource recovery.

8. Presentation

Presentation – Ballina Arterial Roads Strategy

The presentation from Council's Director Civil Services, John Truman was deferred to the November 2019 meeting.

9. General Business

NA

10. Review of Ward Committee Membership

The information in the staff report was noted.

11. Council Documents on Exhibition

The list of previously advertised documents was noted by the Committee.

12. Business Without Notice

i) *Ballina Coast High School*

Andrew Playford advised that the Governor of NSW was visiting the School on Thursday.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

Andrew thanked Council for the 160 trees that were planted at the School.

Andrew advised that the students enjoyed the communications interviews with Paradise FM.

Andrew also thanked Council for the great work done at the Missingham Skatepark.

ii) Kimi Park Issue

George Young advised that rocks had been placed on the steps leading to the beach from Kimi Park, preventing access to the beach. He asked if Council could investigate.

George also asked whether floodgates could be installed at Kimi Park to prevent flooding in that area.

John Truman advised that the trial at Burns Point Ferry Road had been successful and he would provide further information on future projects in the minutes.

Attached for the information of the Committee are notes provided by George Young.

Post Meeting Note

The Council now allocates \$53,000 as a recurrent budget for tide floodgate installations. The priority for funds for this year and next is Skinner Street, plus the construction of our condition assessment and asset inspection work. The next priorities are Grant and Moon Streets and Council has applied for a grant to assist with the funding of these works.

iii) West End Hall

George Young discussed correspondence regarding the closure of the West End Hall he had received from Council. Attached for the information of the Committee are notes provided by George Young.

Post Meeting Note

Also attached is the recent Council report dealing with this matter. As per that report, Council has resolved to proceed with the sale of the land following demolition of the building. The sale proceeds will be returned to the Community Infrastructure Reserve and it is noted Council has assisted the Lions Club establish a new storage facility at Council's depot.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

iv) Ballina Cricket Update

Geoff Jacobs thanked Council for the funding towards the Solar Power at Fripp Oval.

Geoff also thanked Council's Open Spaces staff for the work they did to remove the old fencing and for Council's contribution.

v) Ferry Use – Peak Times

David Felsch asked if the Ferry drivers could be instructed to only allow one truck per crossing during the peak times in the morning and afternoon.

vi) Keppel Street West Ballina

David Felsch asked if when exiting Keppel Street, could both lanes have the right turn option, to improve traffic efficiency.

vii) South Ballina Signage

David Felsch asked if a larger sign could be installed for South Ballina Beach Road at River Drive as the sign is too small.

viii) Turning Area South Ballina

David Felsch asked for Council to reconsider a turn around area at South Ballina at the location shown on the attached photo.

John Truman advised that this request had been reported to Council previously in response to a Notice of Motion. Council considered the feasibility and demand for the proposal and declined to prioritise or allocate funds to the project.

ix) South Ballina Beach Solution

David Felsch advised that he had been in discussion with staff at Richmond Valley Council and they were prepared to work together with Ballina Council staff to find a solution to the issues at South Ballina arising from 4wd access to the beach.

David Felsch also mentioned that a stakeholder meeting had been held the week prior to this meeting and asked if Council knew what the meeting was about.

John Truman confirmed Council was not the land manager for this location and therefore Council does not have jurisdiction for policy or management of the land. Council does however share the concerns and continues to liaise with Government and Richmond Valley Council. John agreed to update David if new information was available from the referenced meeting.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

x) Street Naming – Unnamed Lane between Crane & Swift Streets

Yvonne Scarrabelotti advised the Committee that she had received correspondence from Council proposing "McQueen Lane as the name for this lane. Yvonne gave her support for this name. She thanked Council for giving her the opportunity to respond.

Post Meeting Note

The information has been forwarded to Council's GIS section for inclusion with other submissions received.

xi) Update from Ballina Chamber of Commerce

Susan Meehan thanked Council for their contribution of \$300.00 towards the Boomerang Bags Project. She also discussed their project to display Christmas lights in River Street between Moon and Cherry Streets. The Chamber is also planning a colouring in competition and best dressed shop promotion for the Christmas period.

Susan also reported that the Chamber's Business Awards event was a huge success.

The chamber is also looking at having a combined race day event with the Jockey club.

xii) Roadworks in River Street

Susan Meehan asked when the roadworks would be finished in front for the new Metro Service Station.

John Truman advised that the works were part of the development consent to help optimise the turning capacity of Brunswick Street into River Street and were fully funded by the development. Staff expect the works will be finalised very shortly.

xiii) Tweed Street - Issue

Susan Meehan advised that there was a large lump in the bitumen raised in front of a driveway in Tweed Street opposite Horizon Motor Homes.

xiv) Footpath Dining

Ross Pickering asked if there was a set distance in front of shops for footpath dining as some chairs and tables were further out than others.

John Truman advised that businesses require an approval to operate on a footpath and that there were markers installed on the footpath to delineate the area they are permitted to operate in.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

xv) Thank you from Summerhill Residents Group

John Bout thanked Council for the mowing with the sidearm mower and advised that the owner of the land opposite had committed to keeping their area maintained.

John also thanked Council for the removal of the low bund adjacent to the drain as this had lowered the grass height.

xvi) Light on Deadmans Creek Road

John Bout asked about the timing of the light for Deadmans Creek Road.

John Truman advised he would add a response to the minutes.

Post Meeting Note

Staff are reviewing the Road Safety Audit prepared to assess this proposal. Arrangements for procurement of the light are also well advanced.

xvii) Deadmans Creek Road

John Bout asked if Deadmans Creek Road would be closing.

Cr Meehan advised that Deadmans Creek Road will remain open due to the flooding issues on Tamarind Drive. John Truman advised RMS were preparing a flood report to review the frequent inundation at the Tamarind Drive and Ballina Heights Drive intersection.

John Bout also asked if a risk assessment could be done on the intersection of Summerhill Crescent and Deadmans Creek Road. He would like to see a stop sign installed at this intersection.

xviii) Reside Certification

George Young asked who would undertake the building certification for this development.

John Truman advised that it would be privately certified.

xix) CWA Open Day

Yvonne Scarrebelotti commented that the CWA was having an open day in December and suggested that this could be an opportunity to formally open the work at Captain Cook Park.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

13. Next Meeting

The next meeting is to be held at 4.00pm on Tuesday 12 November 2019.

14. Meeting Close

There being no further business, the meeting closed at 5.45pm.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

A Ward Meeting Attendance Sheet – 10 September 2019		
Name	Business	Signature
Cr Nathan Willis	Ballina Shire Council	
Cr Phil Meehan	Ballina Shire Council	<i>P. Meehan</i>
Cr Stephen McCarthy	Ballina Shire Council	<i>S. McCarthy</i>
Cr David Wright	Ballina Shire Council	<i>D. Wright</i>
Yvonne Scarrabelotti	Ballina CWA	<i>Y. Scarrabelotti</i>
<i>Ryan (Apology)</i>	Ballina CWA	<i>ARoboy</i>
Mr George Young	Ballina Lions Club	<i>G. Young</i>
Mrs Susan Meehan	Ballina Chamber of Commerce & Ballina Retail Action Group	
Ms Margaret Hains	Ballina Day View Club	—
Ms Marilyn McIntosh	Ballina Evening View Club	<i>M. McIntosh</i>
Ms Mary O'Brien	Lighthouse Day Club	—
Mr David Felsch	South Ballina Community Association	<i>D. Felsch</i>
	South Ballina Community Association	—
Mr Geoff Jacobs	Ballina Bears Cricket Club	<i>G. Jacobs</i>
Mr Ross Pickering	Ballina & District Citizens & Ratepayers Association	<i>R. Pickering</i>
Andrew Dougherty	Ballina Lighthouse & Lismore Surf Lifesaving Club	—
	Ballina Lighthouse & Lismore Surf Lifesaving Club	—
Andrew Playford	Ballina Coast High School & East Ballina Lions Club	<i>A. Playford</i>
Neil Denison	Ballina Environment Society	—
	West Ballina Quays Consultative Group	—
Mr John Bout	Summerhill Residents Group	<i>J. Bout</i>
Mr John Truman	Director Civil Services Division	<i>J. Truman</i>
Ms Joanne Cordery	Civil Services Group	<i>J. Cordery</i>

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

11.4 Ferry Operational Matters.DOC



As this would Only be used for turning and not parking 15metres would be ad.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

A WARD COMMITTEE MEETING. 10/9/19

CLOSURE AND SALE OF WEST END HALL

Closed by Council on information provided by the building/planning report by staff, following flooding, causing damage to carpet. The report listed that it contained some asbestos, The Council estimate to remedy the situation was not a large sum of money. Lions had previously replaced asbestos walls with accepted material.

Drainage in the area has been affected by Council initiatives such as River Street Roadworks and other approved developments in the area. One would have thought that Council departments would have reported to the Council the affects of raising road levels and buildings in that area and made the approval subject to remedial requirements. Perhaps recommendations were provided to Council in both cases, so where do I find them and are they available to ratepayers. The matter was reported by a council servant and is in writing. I understood that the building of a "Service Centre" at West Ballina required contributions for drainage in the millions of dollars to address drainage problems. Have these contributions been applied to the Service Station, adjacent to the hall in Brunswick Street? How will drainage of the area be improved or maintained as a result?

Recommendations by Planning staff include the sale of the site. The land with uninterrupted views of the River and parkland opposite and a Boat Ramp adjacent provided by the West End Progress association, is a desirable area in the town. While the site is small it would be thought to bring a return in the hundreds of thousands, not the \$42,500 as stated by the planning/building department. The site has sewerage, water and electricity connected, and is two blocks from the CBD. Have they now discovered what building restrictions they can place on the site? From time to time we see small lots like this in Sydney, bringing sums in the millions and suitable accommodation erected on them. A figure I heard for the sale price was \$650,000 now reduced to \$42,500 if Council spend \$30,000 to demolish and remove the building. Council have already paid Lions \$20,000 to repair the tin shed, so they are in debt \$7,500 plus its rental value and Public Support not provided for three years.

The UCV of the Riverside Block next door, would exceed a Million Dollars plus and a sale price possibly 1.5 / 2 Million dollars.

Has the hall site next door has been loaded with restrictions, to reduce its value to \$42,500

Has the department handling the sale placed restrictions on developments of the site and or why has the estimated sale value been reduced from \$650,00 to \$42,500 and showing a nett loss of \$7,500?

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

When council closed west end hall , council's estimated cost to repair the hall was about \$20,000, but the planning department were determined to have it closed

Council is now prepared to spend \$30,000 to demolish it. And sell it for \$42,500.

It is understood Council went into "Committee" to discuss financial aspects of the sale. What are they not telling us ?

Council have been given ,by the Ballina Lions Club 50 years of free administration , cleaning and repairs , and providing a meeting place for small groups needed in our town, the sum of \$20,000 to be spent on a Council tin shed for storage of equipment . Perhaps Lions can do the job much cheaper than Council , and when the short term lease expires whats next ? The shed is not suitable for meetings and Council have allowed Lions Free rent at the Richmond rooms . How long will this continue ?

Council Having taken over the Westlakes Hall the only other suitable meeting place for small groups at a reasonable cost , and then jacked the rental up to commercial rates and out of reach of small groups on takeover..

Council can't be expected to know all of these small groups , or when they are going to form , so it's only the ones Council know about that they can advise of discounts available if they apply to Council before the grants run out. Council is limiting their assistance to these groups who have supported this shire , in a practical way , since it's inception . They don't thump their chests and beat the drum , but give so much to Ballina and indeed mankind..

The mayor talks of free rent for the lions club , but forgets Councillors are paid for what they do , even if they don't always turn up. Can you imagine the cost to Council over fifty years to book , clean , repair and assist small groups in maintaining the West End Hall. Can You imagine the costs , they are now reflected in the cost of hiring Council rooms.

The \$196,00 contributed by Lions in labour for running the hall , has not been in vane we have helped so many important small groups to provide Ballina Shire a start to provide so many of the amenities , we enjoy today.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

KIMI PARK

The illegal and untidy fence has been removed. However the rocks placed on the steps to the sand have made the access very dangerous , unstable and unsafe. Children in summer use the park and steps to the sand , where they play and swim , they now will have to climb over the jagged rocks .Does Council accept any liability if there is an accident or medical emergency ?

Ratepayer "Fund Us" Proposal

Could Council advise the cost of installation of a flood gate on Kimi Park , to stop the flooding of Riverside Drive and Riverview Avenues,

Also If Council would allow the process to occur.

It may be on Councils ten year plan , but on what end we don't know . This plan seems to Go on and on , what is the starting date ?

George Young

10/9/2019

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

9.7 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina (West End Hall) - Disposal

9.7 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina (West End Hall) - Disposal

Delivery Program

Commercial Services

Objective

To determine if Council wishes to demolish the building prior to sale.

Background

In March 2018, Council resolved to sell 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina (the West End Hall) with the resolution as follows:

"The General Manager is authorized to arrange the disposal of the property containing the West End Hall at 3 Brunswick Street Ballina on the basis that as community infrastructure, the existing hall has reached the end of its economic life.

Further, that the method of disposal of the property, and the outcome, should aim to deliver the best financial return for Council, with net revenue being allocated to the maintenance of Council's other community halls."

In April 2019 Council resolved to allocate \$20,000 of the sale proceeds to provide improvements to the shed at the Council Depot, for storage of goods by the Ballina Lions Club.

This was due to the alternative accommodation offered by Council to the Ballina Lions Club being unsatisfactory for their needs, with a large part of their income generated from the sale of goods such as Christmas cakes.

The Ballina Lions Club has accepted this proposal and the works are scheduled to be completed by the end of September 2019.

This means that Council can now proceed with the sale of the West End Hall and the report that follows seeks direction on whether the property is to be sold with the existing building in place or removed.

Key Issues

- Removal or retention of the existing building

Information

Council has received an updated draft valuation report for this property. The report states that the vacant land value estimate is \$42,500 (GST free) more than the "as is" value; the property is worth more as a vacant site than with the existing building improvements on it.

This is a draft report only as final planning advice is still being sought on what planning outcomes can be achieved on the property due to its relatively small size and flooding impacts.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

9.7 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina (West End Hall) - Disposal

The valuation report has not been included as it provides commercial in confidence information and Council will need to resolve into confidential session to discuss the actual values.

One quotation has been sourced for the demolition of the building, including an asbestos clearance, with the quotation being approximately \$25,000. Development consent is also needed for demolition.

This means that the cost for removal of the building is approximately \$30,000.

The site is a relatively small parcel of land at 208.7 square metres and site filling is needed for any new building.

On balance the preferred approach for the sale, which is likely to be initially by auction, is to make the property as attractive for as many buyers as possible.

On that basis the preferred option is to have the site cleared of the building, including any asbestos.

From a Council perspective the removal of any asbestos is a good outcome for the broader community.

This does carry some risk in that the cost of the removal and remediation could possibly be more than the net increase in the sale value, albeit this is somewhat hypothetical as Council will never be able to confirm what the sale would have been if the building had not been removed.

Legal / Resource / Financial Implications

The net funds generated from the sale will be transferred to the Community Infrastructure Reserve for funding improvements on other halls and community facilities.

Council has already allocated funds from the Community Infrastructure Reserve to various projects in the 2019/20 to 2022/23 Delivery Program and Operational Plan although a buffer is retained in the reserve to assist with any project variations.

As the expenditure on the demolition and removal of the asbestos will be reimbursed, along with the sale proceeds, in a relatively short period, it is recommended that this additional expenditure be financed from the Community Infrastructure Reserve.

Consultation

There has been on-going consultation with the Ballina Lions Club and with valuers in respect to the valuation and sale of the property.

Options

The options are to sell the land as is or with the building removed. As the draft valuation estimates that Council will generate a marginally better return with the building removed the recommendation is to finance the demolition and asbestos removal.

**Minutes of the 'A' Ward Committee Meeting
Held 10 September 2019
In the Committee Rooms, 40 Cherry Street, Ballina**

9.7 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina (West End Hall) - Disposal

This recommendation places more weight on the corporate response in having asbestos removed from our community rather than achieving an improved financial outcome, as the difference is likely to be marginal.

The recommendation also confirms that the \$20,000 allocated to the refurbishment of the Ballina Lions Club storage facility at the Council Depot will be funded from the Community Infrastructure Reserve.

The original resolution was silent on this as the approach was to reimburse the monies from the sale proceeds. This will still happen however, it is appropriate to have an interim funding source identified.

With the Ballina Lions Club agreeing to the works it will be beneficial to have the Depot works completed and all the storage items removed from 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina as promptly as possible.

This will then allow the sale of 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina to proceed without any further delays.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council approves a transfer from the Community Infrastructure Reserve of \$30,000 to allow the removal of the building from 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina.
2. That Council confirms a transfer from the Community Infrastructure Reserve of \$20,000 to finance the improvement works for the storage facility at the Council Depot, Southern Cross Drive, Ballina for the Ballina Lions Club
3. That Council re-affirms that the net proceeds of the sale of 3 Brunswick Street, Ballina are to be transferred to the Community Infrastructure Reserve.

Attachment(s)

Nil